

# PLANNING COMMITTEE

## MINUTES

### 21 NOVEMBER 2018

<b>Chair:</b>	* Councillor Keith Ferry	
<b>Councillors:</b>	* Simon Brown (1) * Stephen Greek * Anjana Patel	* Christine Robson * Sachin Shah (3) * Norman Stevenson (1)
<b>In attendance: (Councillors)</b>	Marilyn Ashton John Hinkley Honey Jamie	Minute 121, 123 Minute 115, 122 Minute 123

\* Denotes Member present  
(1) and (3) Denote category of Reserve Members

#### 107. Attendance by Reserve Members

**RESOLVED:** To note the attendance at this meeting of the following duly appointed Reserve Members:-

##### Ordinary Member

Councillor Ghazanfar Ali  
Councillor Graham Henson  
Councillor Bharat Thakker

##### Reserve Member

Councillor Simon Brown  
Councillor Sachin Shah  
Councillor Norman Stevenson

#### 108. Right of Members to Speak

**RESOLVED:** That, in accordance with Committee Procedure Rule 4.1, the following Councillors, who were not Members of the Committee, be allowed to speak on the agenda item indicated:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Planning Application</u>
Marilyn Ashton	2/06 & 2/08
John Hinkley	1/01 & 2/07
Honey Jamie	2/08

#### **109. Declarations of Interest**

**RESOLVED:** To note that the following interests were declared:

Agenda Item 10 – Representations on Planning Applications (2/06 & 2/08)

Councillor Marilyn Ashton declared a non-pecuniary interest in that she was Stanmore Ward Councillor. She would remain in the room whilst the matters were considered and voted upon.

Agenda Item 10 – Representations on Planning Applications (1/01 & 2/07)

Councillor John Hinkley declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was Ward Councillor for Hatch End. He would remain in the room whilst the matters were considered and voted upon.

Agenda Item 10 – Representations on Planning Applications (2/10)

Councillor Christine Robson declared a non-pecuniary interest in that she was Ward Councillor for West Harrow. She would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

#### **110. Minutes**

**RESOLVED:** That the minutes of the meeting held on 17 October 2018 be taken as read and signed as a correct record.

#### **111. Public Questions, Petitions & Deputations**

**RESOLVED:** To note that no public questions were put, or petitions or deputations received.

#### **112. References from Council and other Committees/Panels**

**RESOLVED:** To note that there were none.

#### **113. Addendum**

**RESOLVED:** To accept both addendums.

## RESOLVED ITEMS

### 114. Representations on Planning Applications

**RESOLVED:** That in accordance with the provisions of Committee Procedure Rule 30 (Part 4B of the Constitution), representations be received in respect of items 1/01, 2/06, 2/07 and 2/08 on the list of planning applications.

### 115. 1/01: Clavering Nursing Home, Royston Grove - P/2344/18

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment to provide a three storey building with basement for Care home (Class C2) with staff accommodation; Amenity space; Parking and Landscaping; Cycle and Refuse storage

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that Policy 3.14 of the London Plan (2016) resisted the loss of existing housing. The proposed development would result in the loss of one dwelling house. However, as there would be a net increase in the overall level of housing, it was considered that this outweighed the London Plan protections and the proposal was deemed acceptable.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Mr Lovatt, and from a representative of the applicant, Mr Henley, and Councillor John Hinkley.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1 of the officer report, and as amended by the addendums.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.*

### 116. 2/01: Bentley Wood High School, Binyon Crescent, Stanmore - P/3831/18

**PROPOSAL:** Single storey extension to North West elevation of kitchen/dining block including provision of extraction ducts to roof; hard surfacing and external alterations

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report, and as amended by the addendums.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.*

**117. 2/02: 66 Elms Road, Harrow Weald - P/0915/18**

**PROPOSAL:** First floor side to rear extension

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- the proposal would not interrupt a 45 degree splay drawn on plan from the nearest two storey front corner of the neighbouring property at No. 64. The nearest first floor window at No. 64 served a bathroom which was not protected for the purposes of the SPD (2010). The proposed extension would not be visible from the bathroom and there would be no loss of light to either the bathroom window or the bay windows at No. 64;
- the proposal met the Residential Design Guide criteria.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

‘The proposed development would harm local character and amenity, contrary to policies DM1 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4 and 7.6 of the London Plan.’

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.*

*Councillors Simon Brown, Keith Ferry, Christine Robson & Sachin Shah voted for the application.*

*Councillors Stephen Greek, Anjana Patel & Norman Stevenson voted against the application.*

**118. 2/03: Stonegrove Gardens, Edgware - P/1571/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Re-development to provide a two storey building for two flats; private and communal amenity space; landscaping; bin / cycle storage

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.*

**119. 2/04: West End Lawn Tennis Club - P/1721/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Installation of three floodlights attached to chain link fence posts at tennis court 6; one floodlight fitted to column 1

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that condition 5 required the applicant to submit post installation measurements in relation to the proposed luminaire set up and aiming angles. The council's lighting engineer had carried out a technical assessment of the proposals and he had not raised any objections to them. She was confident that the engineer had considered any cumulative impact of any light spillage from the luminaires.

A Member proposed an evening site visit to the application site. The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposal would harm local amenity, contrary to policies DM1 and DM48 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy and 7.4 of the London Plan.'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.*

*Councillors Simon Brown, Keith Ferry, Christine Robson & Sachin Shah voted for the application.*

*Councillors Stephen Greek, Anjana Patel & Norman Stevenson voted against the application.*

**120. 2/05:100 - 102 Headstone Road, Harrow - P/1182/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Redevelopment to provide two storey building with habitable roofspace comprising of 5 flats (3 x 2 bedroom flats, 1 x studio flat, and 1 x 1 bedroom flat); bin and cycle stores

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- the hours of operation of the CPZ in the vicinity of the application site was 08.30-18.30, Monday to Saturday;
- the density per hectare was 2.7.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

## RECOMMENDATION A

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to authority being delegated to the Interim Chief Planning Officer for the completion of the Section 106 legal agreement and other enabling legislation and issue of the planning permission and subject to minor amendments to the conditions (set out in Appendix 1 of the officer report) or the legal agreement, and as amended by the addendums.

## RECOMMENDATION B

That if, by 19th January 2019 or such extended period as may be agreed in writing by the Interim Chief Planning Officer, the section 106 Planning Obligation is not completed, then re-delegate the decision to Interim Chief Planning Officer to **REFUSE** planning permission for the appropriate reason.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.*

### 121. **2/06: Anmer Lodge, Coverdale Close & Stanmore Carpark, Dennis Lane, Stanmore - P/4221/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Variation of condition 48 (approved plans) to alter layout and access of the temporary car park attached to planning permission P/0412/14 dated 22/08/2014 for redevelopment of Anmer Lodge & Stanmore car park site in four blocks of various heights: block a to provide 1,692 sq. m (gross) food retail store (class a1) with ancillary café and 3-5 storeys of flats over; block b to provide multi storey car park and 3-4 storeys of flats over; block c to comprise 3-6 storeys of flats with undercroft parking; block d to comprise 2-4 storeys of houses and flats with surface car parking; basement car park below blocks a & b; total 120 dwellings (class c3) (resident permit restricted); 294 car parking spaces (comprising 151 replacement spaces, 50 spaces for the food store and 93 spaces for residents), 8 motorcycle spaces and 144 cycle spaces; access from Dennis lane and Coverdale close. proposal also includes combined heat & power plant; landscaping & roof gardens; diversion of water culvert; works to provide temporary replacement town centre car park (minimum of 151 spaces) and demolition of Anmer Lodge.

Members asked a number of questions regarding the proposed alteration to the layout and access of the temporary car park attached to planning permission P/0412/14. A Member proposed a site visit to the application site to further clarify matters. This was agreed unanimously

**DECISION: DEFER**, subject to a site visit.

### 122. **2/07: 121 Rowlands Avenue, Harrow - P/1472/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Single storey and two storey front extension; two storey side to rear extension; single storey rear extension; basement, alterations to roof to raise ridge height; front garage and external alterations (retrospective)

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- the front, side and rear extensions did not disrupt the symmetry of the building and would not be visible from the street;
- the garage had windows to the side. A condition prohibiting the use of the garage as habitable space could be added to the list of conditions.

Members expressed dissatisfaction and disappointment that the extension had exceeded the parameters of the approval given and that the design guide had not been adhered to.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

‘The proposal, by reason of excessive scale and bulk of the garage, would harm local character and amenity, contrary to policies DM1 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4 and 7.6 of the London Plan.’

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and won.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Mr N’Jie and from Councillor Hinkley. The applicant waived his right of response.

**DECISION: REFUSE**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to refuse the application was unanimous.*

### **123. 2/08: The Powerhouse, 87 West Street, Harrow - P/1516/18**

**PROPOSAL:** The proposal is in relation to an application for Non-Material Amendments to Prior Approval P/0326/17 dated 06/03/2017 for Conversion of Offices (Class B1a) to 14 Self-Contained Flats.

Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- this was a complex legal area and legal opinion had been sought from Counsel, who had advised that as a result of the unauthorised works to the second floor, it could be considered that the Prior Approval may not be relied upon;
- on the basis of the above advice and based on information held by the Council, officers were of the view that, the Prior Approval could not be relied on pursuant to Article 3(5) of the GPDO as advised by Counsel. This was because the GPDO rights would not have been implemented until after the unlawful second floor extension was substantially complete. Therefore, the non-material amendments proposed in the current application should be refused.

The Committee received representations from Councillors Honey Jamie and Marilyn Ashton.

An officer undertook to seek further legal advice regarding whether the Planning section should inform residents already living at the development of the Committee's decision.

The Committee resolved to refuse the application in accordance with the officer recommendation.

**DECISION: REFUSE**, for the following reason:

Within the context of the Prior Approval, and the limitations and conditions of the GPDO, the proposed amendments identified in the above schedule would be non-material amendments. However, as the Prior Approval cannot be relied on pursuant to Article 3(5) of the GPDO the application for non-material amendments should be refused.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to refuse the application was unanimous.*

**124. 2/09: 21 Whitegate Gardens, Harrow - P/3800/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Re-development to provide a pair of semi-detached dwellinghouses with habitable roofspace; new vehicle access onto Whitegate Gardens; parking; amenity space; boundary treatment; landscaping and bin storage.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

'The proposed development would harm local character and amenity, contrary to policies DM1 of the Local Plan, CS1 of the Core Strategy, and 7.4 and 7.6 of the London Plan.'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT**, planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was by a majority of votes.*

*Councillors Simon Brown, Keith Ferry, Christine Robson & Sachin Shah voted for the application.*

*Councillors Stephen Greek, Anjana Patel & Norman Stevenson voted against the application.*

**125. 2/10: 19 Marshall Close - P/3415/18**

**PROPOSAL:** Conversion of children's care home to nine flats, external alterations



Following questions and comments from Members, an officer advised that:

- both existing and new tenants would be permitted to use the off street car park;
- a condition requiring the proposed development to adhere to 'Secure by Design' standards could be added to the list of conditions.

This was agreed by the Committee.

A Member expressed disappointment that a development by the Council did not include an element of affordable housing.

The Committee resolved to approve the officer recommendations.

**DECISION: GRANT** planning permission; add a new condition requiring the development comply with 'Secure by Design' principles.

*The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.*

(Note: The meeting, having commenced at 6.30 pm, closed at 8.37 pm).

(Signed) COUNCILLOR KEITH FERRY  
Chair